# TO BERLANDER STATE

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

## Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

**TU** Berlin

WS 09/10

Untileability

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### Colouring arguments and their limitations

Combinatorial group theory and boundary invariants

- The square lattice
- The tile group

Applications of combinatorial group theory

- The Aztec diamond
- Tiling problems in the hexagonal lattice: Tribones and triangles
- Lozenges and height functions
- Group theoretical remarks
- The tile boundary group
- Tiling theorems

Untileability

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A cell C in a regular (square/ hexagonal/ triangular) lattice is a square (hexagon/triangle) union its boundary.

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A cell C in a regular (square/ hexagonal/ triangular) lattice is a square (hexagon/triangle) union its boundary.
 A region R is a finite union of cells in a regular lattice

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A cell C in a regular (square/ hexagonal/ triangular) lattice is a square (hexagon/triangle) union its boundary.
A region R is a finite union of cells in a regular lattice
A tile τ is a fixed region.

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A cell C in a regular (square/ hexagonal/ triangular) lattice is a square (hexagon/triangle) union its boundary.
A region R is a finite union of cells in a regular lattice
A tile τ is a fixed region.

Let T be a set of tiles, we say that T tiles a region R when R can be can be written as a disjoint union of translates of the tiles in T.



Untileability

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems How can we tell that a region is not tileable?We could use an exhaustive method, which would take a long time!

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems How can we tell that a region is not tileable?

- We could use an exhaustive method, which would take a long time!
- A good approach is to find invariants of tileable regions

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems How can we tell that a region is not tileable?

- We could use an exhaustive method, which would take a long time!
- A good approach is to find invariants of tileable regions

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems How can we tell that a region is not tileable?

- We could use an exhaustive method, which would take a long time!
- A good approach is to find invariants of tileable regions
- ie: The area of a region:

Chessboard	without	2	corner

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems How can we tell that a region is not tileable?

- We could use an exhaustive method, which would take a long time!
- A good approach is to find invariants of tileable regions

ie: The area of a region:



Chessboard without a corner

However another invariant can be found in terms of colouring maps and until recently these were the main tool used to prove the untileablility of a region! Therefore we consider colouring maps...

Untileability

## Example of a colouring argument

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems An example of a colouring argument showing the untileability of a 10 by 10 square in the square lattice by L-tetrominoes:



## Example of a colouring argument



Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The idea is that one numbers the cells of the square as shown below:

1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5

Numbering of the square

we argue that every tile covers either three 5's and one 1, or three 1's and one 5. In either case we obtain a multiple of 8, but the sum over all the squares in the rectangle is 300.

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let A to be the free abelian group on the cells of a regular lattice. Given a tile placement of a tile in  $\mathcal{T}$ , we associate the element of A which is defined by being 1 on the squares which are covered and zero everywhere else.

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let A to be the free abelian group on the cells of a regular lattice. Given a tile placement of a tile in  $\mathcal{T}$ , we associate the element of A which is defined by being 1 on the squares which are covered and zero everywhere else.

Let G be an abelian group, a homomorphism  $f : \mathbb{A} \to G$  is called a *generalised colouring map* if

$$f(\tau) = e \; \forall \tau \in \mathcal{T}$$

where e is the identity element of G.

Untileability

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let  $\mathbb{A}$  to be the free abelian group on the cells of a regular lattice. Given a tile placement of a tile in  $\mathcal{T}$ , we associate the element of  $\mathbb{A}$  which is defined by being 1 on the squares which are covered and zero everywhere else.

Let G be an abelian group, a homomorphism  $f : \mathbb{A} \to G$  is called a *generalised colouring map* if

$$f(\tau) = e \; \forall \tau \in \mathcal{T}$$

where e is the identity element of G. If  $f(R) \neq e$ , then the region R is untileabile. This argument is called a *generalised colouring argument*.

Untileability

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Our previous argument can be seen as a generalised colouring argument, since the numbering can be seen as a map  $f : \mathcal{R} \to \mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$  defined by:

$$f(x_{i,j}) = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{8} & \text{if } i \text{ is odd} \\ \frac{5}{8} & \text{if } i \text{ is even} \end{cases}$$

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Our previous argument can be seen as a generalised colouring argument, since the numbering can be seen as a map  $f : \mathcal{R} \to \mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$  defined by:

$$f(x_{i,j}) = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{8} & \text{if } i \text{ is odd} \\ \frac{5}{8} & \text{if } i \text{ is even} \end{cases}$$

Each tileable region maps to an integer and hence the identity in  $\mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$ , but  $f(R) = \frac{1}{2} \pmod{\mathbb{Z}}$ .

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Consider a set of tiles T with weights of either +1 or -1 on each tile. Then we say that a region R has a signed tiling by Tif there is a covering of R by these weighted tiles, so that the sum of the weights of the tiles that cover a cell inside R is 1 and outside R is zero.

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Consider a set of tiles T with weights of either +1 or -1 on each tile. Then we say that a region R has a signed tiling by Tif there is a covering of R by these weighted tiles, so that the sum of the weights of the tiles that cover a cell inside R is 1 and outside R is zero.

**Remarks:** 

Untileability

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Consider a set of tiles T with weights of either +1 or -1 on each tile. Then we say that a region R has a signed tiling by Tif there is a covering of R by these weighted tiles, so that the sum of the weights of the tiles that cover a cell inside R is 1 and outside R is zero.

### **Remarks:**

Every tileable region is signed tileable.

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Consider a set of tiles T with weights of either +1 or -1 on each tile. Then we say that a region R has a signed tiling by Tif there is a covering of R by these weighted tiles, so that the sum of the weights of the tiles that cover a cell inside R is 1 and outside R is zero.

### **Remarks:**

Every tileable region is signed tileable.

■ A generalised colouring argument will prove signed untileability (as f(τ<sup>-1</sup>) = e).

Untileability

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Consider a set of tiles T with weights of either +1 or -1 on each tile. Then we say that a region R has a signed tiling by Tif there is a covering of R by these weighted tiles, so that the sum of the weights of the tiles that cover a cell inside R is 1 and outside R is zero.

### **Remarks:**

- Every tileable region is signed tileable.
- A generalised colouring argument will prove signed untileability (as f(τ<sup>-1</sup>) = e).

The existence of a signed tiling ⇒ there is no generalised colouring argument.

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The *tile homology group* of  $\mathcal{T}$  is the quotient group  $H(\mathcal{T}) = \mathbb{A}/B(\mathcal{T})$ , where  $B(\mathcal{T}) \subset \mathbb{A}$  is the subgroup generated by all the elements corresponding to possible placement of tiles in  $\mathcal{T}$ .

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square

lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The *tile homology group* of  $\mathcal{T}$  is the quotient group  $H(\mathcal{T}) = \mathbb{A}/B(\mathcal{T})$ , where  $B(\mathcal{T}) \subset \mathbb{A}$  is the subgroup generated by all the elements corresponding to possible placement of tiles in  $\mathcal{T}$ .

**Remarks:** 

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice

The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The *tile homology group* of  $\mathcal{T}$  is the quotient group  $H(\mathcal{T}) = \mathbb{A}/B(\mathcal{T})$ , where  $B(\mathcal{T}) \subset \mathbb{A}$  is the subgroup generated by all the elements corresponding to possible placement of tiles in  $\mathcal{T}$ .

### **Remarks:**

• A region R has a signed tiling if and only if its element in A is a member of  $B(\mathcal{T})$ .

### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The *tile homology group* of  $\mathcal{T}$  is the quotient group  $H(\mathcal{T}) = \mathbb{A}/B(\mathcal{T})$ , where  $B(\mathcal{T}) \subset \mathbb{A}$  is the subgroup generated by all the elements corresponding to possible placement of tiles in  $\mathcal{T}$ .

### **Remarks:**

- A region R has a signed tiling if and only if its element in A is a member of  $B(\mathcal{T})$ .
- A group homomorphism from H(T) to any abelian group gives a generalised colouring argument.

### Proposition (Michael Reid):

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square

The tile group

lattice

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let R be a region that does not have a signed tiling by the set of tiles T. Then there is a numbering of all the cells with rational numbers such that



### Proposition (Michael Reid):

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice

The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Let R be a region that does not have a signed tiling by the set of tiles  $\mathcal{T}$ . Then there is a numbering of all the cells with rational numbers such that

Any placement of a tile covers a total that is an integer, and



Untileability

### Proposition (Michael Reid):

Let R be a region that does not have a signed tiling by the set of tiles T. Then there is a numbering of all the cells with rational numbers such that

- Any placement of a tile covers a total that is an integer, and
- The total covered by the region is not an integer



### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice

The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### Proposition (Michael Reid):

Let R be a region that does not have a signed tiling by the set of tiles  $\mathcal{T}$ . Then there is a numbering of all the cells with rational numbers such that

- Any placement of a tile covers a total that is an integer, and
- The total covered by the region is not an integer

### **Remarks:**

Group theoretical remarks The tile

boundary group Tiling theorems

Colourings

Combinatorial

group theory The square lattice

The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

**I** The map can be thought of as a map  $\psi : \mathbb{A} \to \mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$  in which case it is a generalised colouring argument.

### Proposition (Michael Reid):

Let R be a region that does not have a signed tiling by the set of tiles T. Then there is a numbering of all the cells with rational numbers such that

- Any placement of a tile covers a total that is an integer, and
- The total covered by the region is not an integer

### **Remarks:**

Lozenges Group theoretical remarks

Colourings

Combinatorial

group theory The square

The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

- The tile boundary group Tiling theorems
- The map can be thought of as a map  $\psi : \mathbb{A} \to \mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$  in which case it is a generalised colouring argument.
- If there is no signed tiling then there exists a generalised colouring argument.

### Proof:

Combinatorial group theory

Colourings

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems • Let  $r \in H(T)$  be the image of the region R. R has no signed tiling  $\implies$  r is non-trivial.

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

#### Colourings

**Proof:** 

- Combinatorial group theory
- The square lattice The tile group
- Applications of CGT
- The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges
- Group theoretical remarks
- The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

- Let  $r \in H(\mathcal{T})$  be the image of the region R. R has no signed tiling  $\implies$  r is non-trivial.
- Let  $\langle r \rangle \subset H(\mathcal{T})$  be the cyclic group generated by r, then we can find a group homomorphism  $\phi : \langle r \rangle \to \mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$  such that  $\phi(r) \neq 0$ .

### Colourings

**Proof:** 

- Combinatorial group theory
- The square lattice The tile group
- Applications of CGT
- The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges
- Group theoretical remarks
- The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

- Let  $r \in H(\mathcal{T})$  be the image of the region R. R has no signed tiling  $\implies$  r is non-trivial.
- Let  $\langle r \rangle \subset H(\mathcal{T})$  be the cyclic group generated by r, then we can find a group homomorphism  $\phi : \langle r \rangle \to \mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$  such that  $\phi(r) \neq 0$ .
- Then as  $\mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$  is a divisible abelian group, we can extend this homomorphism to the whole of  $H(\mathcal{T})$ , mapping the identity to the identity and hence signed tileable regions to the identity.
# Signed tilings $\Leftrightarrow$ non-existence of GCAs

Since  $\mathbb A$  is a free abelian group, there exist a homomorphism  $\psi$  such that the following diagram commutes:

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square

lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems



The homomorphism diagram

and  $\psi$  is the homomorphism we wanted

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

#### **Remarks:**

• Often,  $H(\mathcal{T})$  is finitely generated, so  $\phi(H(\mathcal{T})) \subset \mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$  is also finitely generated.

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### **Remarks:**

• Often,  $H(\mathcal{T})$  is finitely generated, so  $\phi(H(\mathcal{T})) \subset \mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$  is also finitely generated.

• Therefore 
$$\phi(H(\mathcal{T})) \subset \frac{1}{N}\mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$$
 for some  $N \in \mathbb{N}$ .

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### Remarks:

Goften, H(T) is finitely generated, so φ(H(T)) ⊂ Q/Z is also finitely generated.

• Therefore 
$$\phi(H(\mathcal{T})) \subset \frac{1}{N}\mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$$
 for some  $N \in \mathbb{N}$ .

Multiplying by N we obtain a numbering of the cells, such that

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square **Remarks:** 

lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

# • Often, $H(\mathcal{T})$ is finitely generated, so $\phi(H(\mathcal{T})) \subset \mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$ is also finitely generated.

• Therefore 
$$\phi(H(\mathcal{T})) \subset \frac{1}{N}\mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$$
 for some  $N \in \mathbb{N}$ .

Multiplying by N we obtain a numbering of the cells, such that  $\bigcirc$  any tile placement covers a total divisible by N, and

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square

lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### **Remarks:**

Goften, H(𝒯) is finitely generated, so φ(H(𝒯)) ⊂ ℚ/ℤ is also finitely generated.

• Therefore 
$$\phi(H(\mathcal{T})) \subset \frac{1}{N}\mathbb{Q}/\mathbb{Z}$$
 for some  $N \in \mathbb{N}$ .

Multiplying by N we obtain a numbering of the cells, such that

any tile placement covers a total divisible by N, and
the region covers a total which is not divisible by N.

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Recall the colouring argument of the Aztec diamond which proves that it cannot be tiled by skew tetrominoes for  $n \equiv 1, 2 \pmod{4}$ :



TU Ber<u>lin</u>

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems



Each tile covers an odd number of white and red cells.

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square

lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems



Each tile covers an odd number of white and red cells.
There are 2n(n+1) squares in the Aztec diamond n(n+1)/2 tiles are used.

TU Berlin

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square

lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems



Each tile covers an odd number of white and red cells.
There are 2n(n+1) squares in the Aztec diamond n(n-2)/2 tiles are used.

• The region contains an even number of black squares  $\implies \frac{n(n+1)}{2}$  must be even.

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square

lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems



Each tile covers an odd number of white and red cells.
There are 2n(n + 1) squares in the Aztec diamond n(n-2)/(2)/(2)/(2)

- The region contains an even number of black squares  $\implies \frac{n(n+1)}{2}$  must be even.
- The Aztec square of order n is untileable for  $n \equiv 1$  or 2 (mod 4).

# The existence of a signed tiling

This will not work for  $n \equiv 3$  or 4 (mod 4) as we can find signed tilings.

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square

lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems



Signed tiling of the Aztec diamond

# Hence we look for stronger invariants, boundary word invariants!

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

### Observing the boundaries

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Idea:

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems As the above has shown, (generalised) colouring arguments approaches are not always successful.

Observe the boundaries traced by the tiles, as well as those of the region needing to be tiled.

## Observing the boundaries

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems As the above has shown, (generalised) colouring arguments approaches are not always successful.

Idea:

- Observe the boundaries traced by the tiles, as well as those of the region needing to be tiled.
- Develop boundary invariants, i.e. properties shared by all regions admitting a tiling.

### Observing the boundaries

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Idea:

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems As the above has shown, (generalised) colouring arguments approaches are not always successful.

Observe the boundaries traced by the tiles, as well as those of the region needing to be tiled.

Develop boundary invariants, i.e. properties shared by all regions admitting a tiling.

Try to conclude the untileability based on the above observations.

### The square lattice as a free group

The oriented paths in the square lattice are described as words in the free group  $\mathbb{F} = \langle A, U \rangle$ 

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems where A and U stand for "Across" and "Up". The directed paths corresponding to words of length 1, are the *edges* of the lattice.



The generators of a square lattice

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Such a directed path is called *closed* if it's starting point coincides with its ending point, and *simple* if it does not cross itself.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

- Such a directed path is called *closed* if it's starting point coincides with its ending point, and *simple* if it does not cross itself.
- We define the *topological boundary* of a region as follows:
  - For a cell, it is the set of its bounding lattice edges, taken counterclockwise.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Such a directed path is called *closed* if it's starting point coincides with its ending point, and *simple* if it does not cross itself.

• We define the *topological boundary* of a region as follows:

- For a cell, it is the set of its bounding lattice edges, taken counterclockwise.
- For a region, it is the union of the topological boundary of the cells it contains, discarding the edges that appear twice with opposite orientations.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Such a directed path is called *closed* if it's starting point coincides with its ending point, and *simple* if it does not cross itself.

We define the *topological boundary* of a region as follows:

- For a cell, it is the set of its bounding lattice edges, taken counterclockwise.
- For a region, it is the union of the topological boundary of the cells it contains, discarding the edges that appear twice with opposite orientations.
- This presentation will treat only simply connected regions, i.e. regions whose complement in ℝ<sup>2</sup> is connected, and whose edges can be ordered into a simple directed path.

### Determining the boundary

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A boundary path of a simply connected region R can be uniquely determined from its first edge and it will be denoted by  $\partial R(e)$ .





 $\partial R(e_2) = UA^2 U^{-2} A^{-1} UA^{-1}$ 

Two boundary words for the T-tromino

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

It makes sense to consider a region in some sense "equivalent" to its translates...

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Untileability

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems It makes sense to consider a region in some sense "equivalent" to its translates...

■ For every word W and every starting edge e one can consider the word W∂R(e)W<sup>-1</sup> (a conjugate boundary word), which corresponds to the boundary path of a translate of R, as traced from a fixed origin.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems It makes sense to consider a region in some sense "equivalent" to its translates...

■ For every word W and every starting edge e one can consider the word W∂R(e)W<sup>-1</sup> (a conjugate boundary word), which corresponds to the boundary path of a translate of R, as traced from a fixed origin.

In the example above, we can see:

 $\partial R(e_2) = (UA^2)\partial R(e_1)(UA^2)^{-1}$ 

• We define the *combinatorial boundary*  $[\partial R]$  of a region to be

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems It makes sense to consider a region in some sense "equivalent" to its translates...

For every word W and every starting edge e one can consider the word W∂R(e)W<sup>-1</sup> (a conjugate boundary word), which corresponds to the boundary path of a translate of R, as traced from a fixed origin.
In the example above, we can see:

 $\partial R(e_2) = (UA^2)\partial R(e_1)(UA^2)^{-1}$ 

• We define the *combinatorial boundary*  $[\partial R]$  of a region to be

 $[\partial R] = \{ W \partial R(e) W^{-1}, W \in \mathbb{F} \}$ 

where e is an edge on the topological boundary of R. By the above, it is well-defined.

Untileability

TU Berlin

# Combinatorics meets group theory

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems We will further use some standard terminology from group theory:

• The subgroup of a free group F, generated by the words  $W_i$ , will be denoted by  $\langle W_1, W_2, \ldots \rangle$ 

# Combinatorics meets group theory

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems We will further use some standard terminology from group theory:

• The subgroup of a free group F, generated by the words  $W_i$ , will be denoted by  $\langle W_1, W_2, \ldots \rangle$ 

• For any subgroup G of F, N(G) stands for the minimal normal subgroup of F containing G, that is

 $N(G) = \langle xGx^{-1}, \forall x \in F \rangle$ 

# Combinatorics meets group theory

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems We will further use some standard terminology from group theory:

• The subgroup of a free group F, generated by the words  $W_i$ , will be denoted by  $\langle W_1, W_2, \ldots \rangle$ 

• For any subgroup G of F, N(G) stands for the minimal normal subgroup of F containing G, that is

 $N(G) = \langle xGx^{-1}, \forall x \in F \rangle$ 

■ Lastly, [G : G] will denote the *commutator subgroup* of G, i.e. the group generated by the commutators  $W_1 W_2 W_1^{-1} W_2^{-1}$  for all  $W_1, W_2 \in G$ .

Untileability

TU Berlin

### Defining the tile group

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Back to the square lattice, the *cycle group* C is the subgroup of  $\mathbb{F}$ , consisting of all words associated to closed directed paths in the lattice. As we will later see, C is [F : F], a normal subgroup, equal in fact to  $N(\langle AUA^{-1}U^{-1}\rangle)$ .

### Defining the tile group

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

#### Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Back to the square lattice, the *cycle group* C is the subgroup of  $\mathbb{F}$ , consisting of all words associated to closed directed paths in the lattice. As we will later see, C is [F : F], a normal subgroup, equal in fact to  $N(\langle AUA^{-1}U^{-1}\rangle)$ .

To a set of tiles  $\mathcal{T} = \{\tau_i, i \in \overline{1, m}\}$  we assign a subgroup of F, called the *tile group*, denoted by  $\mathcal{T}(\mathcal{T})$ , which contains the combinatorial boundaries of all tiles in  $\mathcal{T}$ , that is

$$T(\mathcal{T}) = \langle W \partial \tau_i(e_i) W^{-1} : W \in \mathbb{F}, 1 \le i \le m \rangle$$

where  $\partial \tau_i(e_i)$  is an oriented boundary of  $\tau_i$ .

Untileability

TU Berlin

# The tile homotopy group

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems In fact, T(T) is also a normal subgroup of C, and we define the *tile homotopy group* to be the quotient

$$h(\mathcal{T}) = C/T(\mathcal{T})$$

The basic invariant we assign a region R which is to be tiled with a set of tiles T, is the conjugacy class in (T)corresponding to the combinatorial boundary  $[\partial R]$ .

TU Berlin



Untileability

#### This gives rise to the following :

#### Colourings

#### Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

#### Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

#### Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

For a region R to have a tiling by a set of tiles  $\mathcal{T}$  it is necessary that the combinatorial boundary  $[\partial R]$  is an element of the tile group  $\mathcal{T}(\mathcal{T})$ .



#### This gives rise to the following :

#### Colourings

#### Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

#### Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

#### Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

For a region R to have a tiling by a set of tiles  $\mathcal{T}$  it is necessary that the combinatorial boundary  $[\partial R]$  is an element of the tile group  $\mathcal{T}(\mathcal{T})$ .

### Sketch of proof:

Solution As T(T) is a normal group, it suffices to show that some oriented boundary  $[\partial R(e)]$  is in T(T). This follows by induction by the number of tiles needed to tile R.

#### This gives rise to the following :

#### Colourings

#### Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

#### Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

For a region R to have a tiling by a set of tiles  $\mathcal{T}$  it is necessary that the combinatorial boundary  $[\partial R]$  is an element of the tile group  $\mathcal{T}(\mathcal{T})$ .

### Sketch of proof:

- As  $T(\mathcal{T})$  is a normal group, it suffices to show that some oriented boundary  $[\partial R(e)]$  is in  $T(\mathcal{T})$ . This follows by induction by the number of tiles needed to tile R.
- The base case (only one tile is needed) follows immediately.

# **Topological considerations**

### Sketch of proof, continued:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Simply connected regions can be described as topological disks with Jordan curve boundaries. (The particular case of a boundary touching itself at a vertex can be resolved if we considered a copy of the region "thickened" at that corner).

Untileability
# **Topological considerations**

### Sketch of proof, continued:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Simply connected regions can be described as topological disks with Jordan curve boundaries. (The particular case of a boundary touching itself at a vertex can be resolved if we considered a copy of the region "thickened" at that corner).



Thickening of a corner

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

## The induction step

### Sketch of proof, continued:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A region can be decomposed in smaller regions, respecting the additive properties of the boundaries, mentioned in the definition of a topological boundary.

# The induction step

### Sketch of proof, continued:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A region can be decomposed in smaller regions, respecting the additive properties of the boundaries, mentioned in the definition of a topological boundary.

Now the following claim has an accessible (albeit technical) proof:

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

# The induction step

### Sketch of proof, continued:

- Colourings
- Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

#### Applications of CGT

- The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges
- Group theoretical remarks
- The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

- A region can be decomposed in smaller regions, respecting the additive properties of the boundaries, mentioned in the definition of a topological boundary.
- Now the following claim has an accessible (albeit technical) proof:

*Claim*: There exists a decomposition  $R = R^* \cup R^{**}$  such that  $R^*, R^{**}$  are non-empty simply connected regions which can be tiled by  $\mathcal{T}$ , and there are directed edges  $e_1$  of  $R^*$  and  $e_2$  of  $R^{**}$  such that :

$$\partial R(e_1) = \partial R^{**}(e_2) \partial R^*(e_1)$$

Untileability

# Visualizing the decomposition

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

#### Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The claim easily completes the induction step.



Visualizing the induction step

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

Sketch of proof, continued:

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A construction allowing to easily observe the boundary invariants is the *Cayley graph*, denoted by  $\mathcal{G}(G := F/K)$ , where F is a free group and K is a normal subgroup of relations.

This graph (also known as group diagram), is drawn as follows:

**Solution** Each element of G corresponds to a vertex W.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A construction allowing to easily observe the boundary invariants is the *Cayley graph*, denoted by  $\mathcal{G}(G := F/K)$ , where F is a free group and K is a normal subgroup of relations.

This graph (also known as group diagram), is drawn as follows:

Each element of G corresponds to a vertex W.
Each generator S<sub>i</sub> of F corresponds to a directed edge joining W with S<sub>i</sub>W.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A construction allowing to easily observe the boundary invariants is the *Cayley graph*, denoted by  $\mathcal{G}(G := F/K)$ , where F is a free group and K is a normal subgroup of relations.

This graph (also known as group diagram), is drawn as follows:

**Solution** Each element of G corresponds to a vertex W.

Each generator S<sub>i</sub> of F corresponds to a directed edge joining W with S<sub>i</sub>W.

Hence, each node has g ingoing and g outgoing edges, where g is the number of generators of F.

Untileability

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A construction allowing to easily observe the boundary invariants is the *Cayley graph*, denoted by  $\mathcal{G}(G := F/K)$ , where F is a free group and K is a normal subgroup of relations.

This graph (also known as group diagram), is drawn as follows:

- **Solution** Each element of G corresponds to a vertex W.
- Each generator S<sub>i</sub> of F corresponds to a directed edge joining W with S<sub>i</sub>W.
- Hence, each node has g ingoing and g outgoing edges, where g is the number of generators of F.
- For generators of order two there will be drawn undirected edges.

The group diagram will be used in the context of tileability as follows:

• Let  $H \supseteq T(\mathcal{T})$  be a normal subgroup and  $\mathcal{G}_H$  the Cayley graph  $\mathcal{G}_H$  corresponding to  $\mathbb{G}/H$ .

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

#### Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Untileability

The group diagram will be used in the context of tileability as follows:

- Let  $H \supseteq T(\mathcal{T})$  be a normal subgroup and  $\mathcal{G}_H$  the Cayley graph  $\mathcal{G}_H$  corresponding to  $\mathbb{G}/H$ .
  - Note that, tracing the boundary of any tile in the Cayley graph, one will obtain a closed path.

Colourings Combinatorial

group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges Group theoretical remarks The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

The group diagram will be used in the context of tileability as follows:

- Let  $H \supseteq T(\mathcal{T})$  be a normal subgroup and  $\mathcal{G}_H$  the Cayley graph  $\mathcal{G}_H$  corresponding to  $\mathbb{G}/H$ .
  - Note that, tracing the boundary of any tile in the Cayley graph, one will obtain a closed path.
  - For the region R to be tiled, observe the directed path tracing the image in  $\mathcal{G}_H$  of the topological boundary of the chosen region.

The hexagonal lattice

theoretical remarks

Colourings Combinatorial

group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

The group diagram will be used in the context of tileability as follows:

- Let  $H \supseteq T(\mathcal{T})$  be a normal subgroup and  $\mathcal{G}_H$  the Cayley graph  $\mathcal{G}_H$  corresponding to  $\mathbb{G}/H$ .
  - Note that, tracing the boundary of any tile in the Cayley graph, one will obtain a closed path.
  - For the region R to be tiled, observe the directed path tracing the image in  $\mathcal{G}_H$  of the topological boundary of the chosen region.
  - If the above path does not close, a tiling is impossible.

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

The group diagram will be used in the context of tileability as follows:

- Let  $H \supseteq T(\mathcal{T})$  be a normal subgroup and  $\mathcal{G}_H$  the Cayley graph  $\mathcal{G}_H$  corresponding to  $\mathbb{G}/H$ .
- Note that, tracing the boundary of any tile in the Cayley graph, one will obtain a closed path.
- For the region R to be tiled, observe the directed path tracing the image in  $\mathcal{G}_H$  of the topological boundary of the chosen region.
- If the above path does not close, a tiling is impossible.
- A closed path is necessary, but not sufficient. We will draw stronger conclusions based on *winding numbers*.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let s be a cell in our graph,  $x_s \in Int(s)$ , and P a closed directed path. The winding number W(P; s) measures how many times does P enclose s in a counterclockwise direction, and is given by the formula

$$w(P;s)=\frac{1}{2\pi i}\oint_P\frac{1}{z-x_s}dz.$$

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let s be a cell in our graph,  $x_s \in Int(s)$ , and P a closed directed path. The winding number W(P; s) measures how many times does P enclose s in a counterclockwise direction, and is given by the formula

$$w(P;s)=\frac{1}{2\pi i}\oint_P\frac{1}{z-x_s}dz.$$

Properties of the winding number:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let s be a cell in our graph,  $x_s \in Int(s)$ , and P a closed directed path. The winding number W(P; s) measures how many times does P enclose s in a counterclockwise direction, and is given by the formula

$$w(P;s)=\frac{1}{2\pi i}\oint_P\frac{1}{z-x_s}dz.$$

Properties of the winding number:

**•** The formula above does not depend on the choice of  $x_s$ .

Untileability

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let s be a cell in our graph,  $x_s \in Int(s)$ , and P a closed directed path. The winding number W(P; s) measures how many times does P enclose s in a counterclockwise direction, and is given by the formula

$$w(P;s)=\frac{1}{2\pi i}\oint_P\frac{1}{z-x_s}dz.$$

Properties of the winding number:

The formula above does not depend on the choice of x<sub>s</sub>.
It is additive: For two closed paths P<sub>1</sub>, P<sub>2</sub> starting at the same point, one has:

$$w(P_1P_2;s) = w(P_1;s) + w(P_2;s)$$

Untileability

### Applications to tileability

We will denote the set of cells (faces) of the Cayley graph  $G_H$  by C. Upon fortunate choice of H,

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

$$\exists A \subset \mathcal{C}s.t. \; \sum_{s \in A} w(\partial au(e);s) = 0, \; \forall au \in \mathcal{T} \; (*)$$

If the boundary of region R does not respect the above equality, untileability can be concluded.

**Remarks:** 

Untileability

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

### Applications to tileability

We will denote the set of cells (faces) of the Cayley graph  $G_H$  by C. Upon fortunate choice of H,

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

$$\exists A \subset \mathcal{C}s.t. \; \sum_{s \in A} w(\partial \tau(e); s) = 0, \; \forall \tau \in \mathcal{T} \; (*)$$

If the boundary of region R does not respect the above equality, untileability can be concluded.

### **Remarks:**

More conditions like (\*) could be needed for a particular problem, or slightly modified versions.

## Applications to tileability

We will denote the set of cells (faces) of the Cayley graph  $G_H$  by C. Upon fortunate choice of H,

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

$$\exists A \subset \mathcal{C}s.t. \; \sum_{s \in A} w(\partial \tau(e); s) = 0, \; \forall \tau \in \mathcal{T} \; (*)$$

If the boundary of region R does not respect the above equality, untileability can be concluded.

### **Remarks:**

- More conditions like (\*) could be needed for a particular problem, or slightly modified versions.
- Finding such a group *H*, "In general, it trades one hard problem for another" (J. Conway).

Untileability

## **Recalling the Aztec diamond**



Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

# The corresponding boundary words

	They give rise to the following boundary words:						
Colourings Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group							
Applications of CGT The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges							
Group theoretical remarks The tile boundary group Tiling theorems							
Untilea	bility	Thomas Hixon, Irir	na Mustata	TU Berlin	Tilings	Seminar, WS 09/	10

### The corresponding boundary words

They give rise to the following boundary words:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems  $\partial \tau_1(e_1) = U^{-1}AU^{-1}A^{-2}UA^{-1}UA^2$  $\partial \tau_2(e_2) = U^{-2}A^{-1}U^{-1}A^{-1}U^2AUA$  $\partial \tau_3(e_3) = U^{-1}AU^{-2}A^{-1}UA^{-1}U^2A$  $\partial \tau_4(e_4) = U^{-1}A^{-1}U^{-1}A^{-2}UAUA^2$ 

Untileability

### The corresponding boundary words

They give rise to the following boundary words:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square

lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems  $\partial \tau_1(e_1) = U^{-1}AU^{-1}A^{-2}UA^{-1}UA^2$  $\partial \tau_2(e_2) = U^{-2}A^{-1}U^{-1}A^{-1}U^2AUA$  $\partial \tau_3(e_3) = U^{-1}AU^{-2}A^{-1}UA^{-1}U^2A$  $\partial \tau_4(e_4) = U^{-1}A^{-1}U^{-1}A^{-2}UAUA^2$ 

whereas the Aztec diamond of order n can be assigned the following boundary word:

 $(AU^{-1})^n (U^{-1}A^{-1})^n (A^{-1}U)^n (UA)^n.$ 

Untileability

## Statement of untileability

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

Proposition:

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### The Aztec diamond can never be tiled by skew tetrominoes.



### Statement of untileability

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### Proposition:

The Aztec diamond can never be tiled by skew tetrominoes.

We have seen in the previous section the proof of the above for diamonds of size  $n \equiv 1, 2 \pmod{4}$ .

### Statement of untileability

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### Proposition:

The Aztec diamond can never be tiled by skew tetrominoes.

We have seen in the previous section the proof of the above for diamonds of size  $n \equiv 1, 2 \pmod{4}$ .

We have also seen that there exist signed tilings for  $n \equiv 0, 3 \pmod{4}$ , so in this case colouring arguments won't suffice. We will develop an approach using the notions introduced above.

Untileability

# Constructing the Cayley graph

Now take the subset *H* to be  $N(\langle AUAU, AU^{-1}AU^{-1} \rangle)$ , and construct the Cayley graph  $\mathcal{G}_H$ , pictured below.

#### Colourings Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group Applications Image of the fourth tile of CGT The Aztec $\partial au_4(e_4) = U^{-1}A^{-1}$ diamond $U^{-1}A^{-2}UAUA^2$ The hexagonal lattice Cxn4 Ċxn Lozenges Group theoretical remarks **c**x**n C**x**n** The tile boundary group Tiling theorems $(AU^{-1})^n (U^{-1}A^{-1})^n$ Image of the aztec diamond $(A^{-1}U)^{n}(UA)^{n}$ The image of the region and the tiles in the Cavley graph



Untileability

### Note the following:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Solution Both the tiles and the Aztec diamond have their boundaries mapped to closed paths in  $\mathcal{G}_H$ .

### Note the following:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Both the tiles and the Aztec diamond have their boundaries mapped to closed paths in G<sub>H</sub>.

• Tracing the contour of each  $\tau_i$ , one easily notes that the sum of the winding numbers around all cells is 0.

### Note the following:

- Colourings
- Combinatorial group theory
- The square lattice The tile group
- Applications of CGT
- The Aztec diamond
- The hexagonal lattice Lozenges
- Group theoretical remarks
- The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

- Solution Both the tiles and the Aztec diamond have their boundaries mapped to closed paths in  $\mathcal{G}_H$ .
- Tracing the contour of each τ<sub>i</sub>, one easily notes that the sum of the winding numbers around all cells is 0.
- Solution As the winding number is additive, every element in T(T) maps to a directed closed path with 0 winding-number.

### Note the following:

- Colourings
- Combinatorial group theory
- The square lattice The tile group
- Applications of CGT
- The Aztec diamond
- The hexagonal lattice Lozenges
- Group theoretical remarks
- The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

- Solution Both the tiles and the Aztec diamond have their boundaries mapped to closed paths in  $\mathcal{G}_H$ .
- Tracing the contour of each  $\tau_i$ , one easily notes that the sum of the winding numbers around all cells is 0.
- As the winding number is additive, every element in T(T) maps to a directed closed path with 0 winding-number.
- However, the Aztec diamond has a winding number of either 4n or -4n ( depending on the starting point), hence untileability by skew tetrominoes can be concluded.

# Stating the tribone tiling problem

We will now try to apply some of these ideas on the following problem: Can we tile triangular regions  $T_n$  in the hexagonal lattice with the set of tiles  $\mathcal{T}$  (called *tribones*) below?

Colourings

lattice

lattice

Group

Combinatorial



### The result we aim at

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems After playing around with the tiles you will find that a tiling is hard to find, so maybe it is untileable!
### The result we aim at

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems After playing around with the tiles you will find that a tiling is hard to find, so maybe it is untileable!

#### Theorem (Conway and Lagarias):

It is impossible to tile the triangular region  $T_n$  in the hexagonal lattice by tribones and their  $120^\circ$  and  $240^\circ$  rotations.



### The result we aim at

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems After playing around with the tiles you will find that a tiling is hard to find, so maybe it is untileable!

#### Theorem (Conway and Lagarias):

It is impossible to tile the triangular region  $T_n$  in the hexagonal lattice by tribones and their 120° and 240° rotations.

Clearly as the number of hexagons in  $T_n$  is n(n+1)/2, so either *n* or n+1 must be divisible by 3 (tile covers 3 hexagons). This rules out  $n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}$ .

Untileability

TU Berlin

## Colouring arguments are not useful here

Notice that for n = 8 we can find a signed tiling of the triangle, so we are indicated once again that we need to argue otherwise than colouring arguments!



#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

## Observations about the hexagonal lattice

We label the lines of the hexagonal lattice *a*, *b*, and *c* if they are at  $0^{\circ}$ ,  $120^{\circ}$ , and  $60^{\circ}$  respectively, as undirected edges.

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems



Hexagonal lattice as Cayley graph

Untileability

### Observations about the hexagonal lattice

We label the lines of the hexagonal lattice *a*, *b*, and *c* if they are at  $0^{\circ}$ ,  $120^{\circ}$ , and  $60^{\circ}$  respectively, as undirected edges.

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems



Hexagonal lattice as Cayley graph

We see that this is the Cayley graph of the group  $\mathbb{H}=\langle a,b,c|a^2=b^2=c^2=(abc)^2=1\rangle$ 

Note that none of the edges are directed in this graph, as all the generators have order 2.

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

### The tribone boundary words

### We also note that the boundary words of the tiles are:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

• 
$$t_1 = (ab)^3 c (ab)^3 c$$
  
•  $t_2 = (bc)^3 a (bc)^3 a$   
•  $t_3 = (ca)^3 b (ca)^3 b$ 







The labeled tribones

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

# The boundary of $T_n$



#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems



The triangle in the hexagonal lattice

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### • If $T_n$ is tileable then $[\partial T_n] \in T(\mathcal{T})$ .

Untileability

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems • If  $T_n$  is tileable then  $[\partial T_n] \in T(\mathcal{T})$ .

• To show the contrary we will consider the special group  $\mathbb{S} := N(\langle (bc)^3, (ca)^3, (ab)^3 \rangle).$ 

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### • If $T_n$ is tileable then $[\partial T_n] \in T(\mathcal{T})$ .

• To show the contrary we will consider the special group  $\mathbb{S} := N(\langle (bc)^3, (ca)^3, (ab)^3 \rangle).$ 

#### Claim:

Both the combinatorial boundary  $[\partial T_n]$  and the Tile group T(T) are contained in  $\mathbb{S}$ 

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### • If $T_n$ is tileable then $[\partial T_n] \in T(\mathcal{T})$ .

• To show the contrary we will consider the special group  $\mathbb{S} := N(\langle (bc)^3, (ca)^3, (ab)^3 \rangle).$ 

#### Claim:

Both the combinatorial boundary  $[\partial T_n]$  and the Tile group T(T) are contained in  $\mathbb{S}$ 

#### **Proof of Claim:**

It is enough to show that the generators of  $T(\mathcal{T})$  and  $[\partial T_n]$  are in  $\mathbb{S}$ . This can be done by looking at the Cayley graph (denoted  $\mathcal{G}_S$  of  $\mathbb{H}/\mathbb{S}$ ).

### The relabeled hexagonal lattice

### The Cayley graph of $\mathcal{G}_{S} := \mathbb{H}/N(\langle (bc)^{3}, (ca)^{3}, (ab)^{3} \rangle)$ is

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems



#### $\mathcal{G}_{\mathcal{S}}$ of $\mathbb{H}/\mathbb{S}$

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

# Observations regarding $\mathcal{G}_S$

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Surprisingly, it is again the hexagonal lattice, albeit differently labeled. This time, it is composed of infinitely many *ab*, *bc* and *ca* hexagons instead of *abc* hexagons.

# **Observations regarding** $\mathcal{G}_S$

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Surprisingly, it is again the hexagonal lattice, albeit differently labeled. This time, it is composed of infinitely many *ab*, *bc* and *ca* hexagons instead of *abc* hexagons.
What we first need to do is to show that shadow paths of the generators of T(T) and [∂T<sub>n</sub>] in G<sub>S</sub> are closed.

## **Observations regarding** $G_S$

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Surprisingly, it is again the hexagonal lattice, albeit differently labeled. This time, it is composed of infinitely many *ab*, *bc* and *ca* hexagons instead of *abc* hexagons.
What we first need to do is to show that shadow paths of the generators of *T*(*T*) and [∂*T<sub>n</sub>*] in *G<sub>S</sub>* are closed.
The case of generator *t*<sub>1</sub> = (*ab*)<sup>3</sup>*c*(*ab*)<sup>3</sup>*c* is shown below and the results are similar for *t*<sub>2</sub> and *t*<sub>3</sub>.





Shadow path of a generator in the Cayley graph

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

### Reducing the analysis to n = 3k.

The combinatorial boundary of  $T_n$  is clearly in S when  $n = 3k(k \in \mathbb{N})$ , as the word is just  $(bc)^{3k}(ab)^{3k}(ca)^{3k}$ .

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

### Reducing the analysis to n = 3k.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The combinatorial boundary of  $T_n$  is clearly in  $\mathbb{S}$  when  $n = 3k(k \in \mathbb{N})$ , as the word is just  $(bc)^{3k}(ab)^{3k}(ca)^{3k}$ . When  $n \equiv 2 \pmod{3}$ , we notice that if we add a line of tribones to one side of  $T_n$  we obtain  $T_{3k}$  for some k. In  $\mathcal{G}_S$  this can be seen as adding in several closed loops to the loop of  $T_n$  to obtain a new loop, that of  $T_{n+1}$ .



Extending a triangle

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

## Winding numbers in the $\mathcal{G}_S$

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems **•** For a path P in the  $G_S$  and a set of cells S define

$$w(P;S) = \sum_{s \in S} w(P;s)$$

where w(P;s) is defined as before.

# Winding numbers in the $\mathcal{G}_S$

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems • For a path P in the  $G_S$  and a set of cells S define

$$w(P;S) = \sum_{s \in S} w(P;s)$$

where w(P;s) is defined as before.

• Let  $S_1, S_2$ , and  $S_3$  be the set of all the *ab*, *bc*, and *ca* hexagons respectively.

Taking any word u in  $\mathbb{S}$ , then define the group homomorphism  $W : \mathbb{S} \to \mathbb{Z}^3$  by

 $W(u) = (w(u; S_1), w(u; S_2), w(u; S_3))$ 

where u is considered to be the path of the word in  $\mathcal{G}_S$ .

Untileability

TU Berlin

#### With this definition we see that:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems •  $W(t_1) = W(t_2) = W(t_3) = (0, 0, 0)$ , hence all conjugates are mapped to (0,0,0) and so  $W(T(T)) = \{(0,0,0)\}$ .

#### With this definition we see that:

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems ■  $W(t_1) = W(t_2) = W(t_3) = (0,0,0)$ , hence all conjugates are mapped to (0,0,0) and so  $W(T(T)) = \{(0,0,0)\}$ . ■  $W((bc)^{3k}(ab)^{3k}(ca)^{3k}) \neq (0,0,0)$ .

With this definition we see that:

<b>^</b>		
	OUL	nos
00	ouii	- B-

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

-----

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems W(t<sub>1</sub>) = W(t<sub>2</sub>) = W(t<sub>3</sub>) = (0,0,0), hence all conjugates are mapped to (0,0,0) and so W(T(T)) = {(0,0,0)}.
W((bc)<sup>3k</sup>(ab)<sup>3k</sup>(ca)<sup>3k</sup>) ≠ (0,0,0).
W((bc)<sup>3k+2</sup>(ab)<sup>3k+2</sup>(ca)<sup>3k+2</sup>) = W((bc)<sup>3(k+1)</sup>(ab)<sup>3(k+1)</sup>(ca)<sup>3(k+1)</sup>) ≠ 0, since we can add tribones as before to go from the case n = 3k + 2 to n = 3(k + 1) and we also have w(t<sub>i</sub>; S) = 0 for i ∈ {1,2,3}.

With this definition we see that:

<b>^</b>		
	OUL	nos
00	ouii	- B-

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems W(t<sub>1</sub>) = W(t<sub>2</sub>) = W(t<sub>3</sub>) = (0,0,0), hence all conjugates are mapped to (0,0,0) and so W(T(T)) = {(0,0,0)}.
W((bc)<sup>3k</sup>(ab)<sup>3k</sup>(ca)<sup>3k</sup>) ≠ (0,0,0).
W((bc)<sup>3k+2</sup>(ab)<sup>3k+2</sup>(ca)<sup>3k+2</sup>) = W((bc)<sup>3(k+1)</sup>(ab)<sup>3(k+1)</sup>(ca)<sup>3(k+1)</sup>) ≠ 0, since we can add tribones as before to go from the case n = 3k + 2 to n = 3(k + 1) and we also have w(t<sub>i</sub>; S) = 0 for i ∈ {1,2,3}.

Therefore  $[\partial T_n] \not\subset T(\mathcal{T})$ , hence  $T_n$  is untileable by tribones, proving Conway's theorem.

TU Berlin

# **Tiling** $T_n$ by $T_2$



### **Restricted tileability**

#### Colourings

**Combinatorial** group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### The triangular region $T_n$ in the hexagonal lattice can be tiled by $T_2$ 's if and only if $n \equiv 0, 2, 9$ , or 11 (mod 12).



Untileability

Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

## **Restricted tileability**

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

# Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

The triangular region  $T_n$  in the hexagonal lattice can be tiled by  $T_2$ 's if and only if  $n \equiv 0, 2, 9$ , or 11 (mod 12).

#### Proceeding with the proof:

•  $T_n$  is untileable for  $n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}$  (due to the area invariant).

## **Restricted tileability**

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias): The triangular region $T_n$ in the hexagonal lattice can be tiled by

 $T_2$ 's if and only if  $n \equiv 0, 2, 9$ , or 11 (mod 12).

#### Proceeding with the proof:

•  $T_n$  is untileable for  $n \equiv 1 \pmod{3}$  (due to the area invariant).

• We are left to show that  $T_n$  is untileable for  $n \equiv 3, 5, 6, 8 \pmod{12}$ .

TU Berlin

# Changing to square lattice

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The problem can be translated to an equivalent problem in the square lattice by 'contracting an edge and reshaping'.





Converting from the hexagonal to the square lattice

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

# The new problem

	This c	onverts the problem	to:		
Colourings					
Combinatorial group theory The square lattice The tile group					
Applications of CGT The Aztec diamond The hexagonal Lattice Lozenges Group theoretical remarks The tile bounder group		T <sub>8</sub>	$R_1$	R <sub>2</sub>	
Tiling theorems	E	Resta	tement of the problem		
Untilea	bility	Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata	TU Berlin	Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10	

## The tile boundaries



## The tile boundaries



### A new, not regular Cayley graph

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let  $\mathbb{S} := N(\langle A^3, U^3, (U^{-1}A)^3 \rangle) \subset \mathbb{F}$ . Once again  $\mathbb{S}$  contains  $[\partial T_n]$  and  $T(\mathcal{T})$ , as their paths are loops the Cayley graph  $\mathbb{F}_S := \mathbb{F}/\mathbb{S}$ :

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

### A new, not regular Cayley graph

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let  $\mathbb{S} := N(\langle A^3, U^3, (U^{-1}A)^3 \rangle) \subset \mathbb{F}$ . Once again  $\mathbb{S}$  contains  $[\partial T_n]$  and  $T(\mathcal{T})$ , as their paths are loops the Cayley graph  $\mathbb{F}_S := \mathbb{F}/\mathbb{S}$ :



Shadow paths of the region and of the tiles

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

### A new, not regular Cayley graph

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let  $\mathbb{S} := N(\langle A^3, U^3, (U^{-1}A)^3 \rangle) \subset \mathbb{F}$ . Once again  $\mathbb{S}$  contains  $[\partial T_n]$  and  $T(\mathcal{T})$ , as their paths are loops the Cayley graph  $\mathbb{F}_S := \mathbb{F}/\mathbb{S}$ :



Shadow paths of the region and of the tiles

**Note:** due to the relations  $A^3$ ,  $U^3$  and  $(A^{-1}U)^3$ , we just need to consider  $n \equiv 2$  or 3 (mod 3) to show that  $\partial T_n$  is in S.

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

## Observing the winding numbers

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Once again we use the winding number, consider the word as a path in  $\mathbb{F}_S$  starting from a fixed vertex. Let S := the set of hexagonal regions, then

•  $w(\partial R_1; S) = 1$ •  $w(\partial R_2; S) = -1$ 

and

## Observing the winding numbers

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical

remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Once again we use the winding number, consider the word as a path in  $\mathbb{F}_S$  starting from a fixed vertex. Let S := the set of hexagonal regions, then

$$w(\partial R_1; S) = 1$$
  
$$w(\partial R_2; S) = -1$$

and

$$w(\partial T_n; S) = \left\lceil \frac{N+1}{3} \right\rceil \qquad (1.0)$$

Untileability

TU Berlin
Suppose  $\partial T_n \in T(T)$  then for some words  $W_i$ , some  $\epsilon_i = 1$  or -1 and  $k_i = 1$  or 2 we have

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Suppose  $\partial T_n \in T(T)$  then for some words  $W_i$ , some  $\epsilon_i = 1$  or -1 and  $k_i = 1$  or 2 we have

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical

remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

$$\partial T_n = \prod_{i=1}^m W_i (\partial R_{k_i})^{\epsilon_i} W_i^{-1} \qquad (1.1)$$

#### and therefore

Suppose  $\partial T_n \in T(T)$  then for some words  $W_i$ , some  $\epsilon_i = 1$  or -1 and  $k_i = 1$  or 2 we have

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

$$\partial T_n = \prod_{i=1}^m W_i (\partial R_{k_i})^{\epsilon_i} W_i^{-1} \qquad (1.1)$$

#### and therefore

$$w(\partial T_n; S) = \sum_{i=1}^m w(W_i(\partial R_{k_i})^{\epsilon_i} W_i^{-1}; S)$$
$$= \sum_{i=1}^m \epsilon_i w(\partial R_{k_i}; S) \equiv \pmod{2} \qquad (1.2)$$

Untileability

i=1

Consider a word in  $\mathbb S$  as the path traced in the original lattice starting at (0,0).

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let  $\psi : \mathbb{S} \to \mathbb{Z}$  be the winding number around the square cells.

Untileability

Consider a word in  $\mathbb S$  as the path traced in the original lattice starting at (0,0).

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let  $\psi : \mathbb{S} \to \mathbb{Z}$  be the winding number around the square cells.

$$\psi(WR_iW^{-1}) = \psi(R_i) = 3$$
  
$$\psi(T_n) = \binom{n+1}{k}$$
  
using (1.1) we get that

Consider a word in  $\mathbb S$  as the path traced in the original lattice starting at (0,0).

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let  $\psi : \mathbb{S} \to \mathbb{Z}$  be the winding number around the square cells.

$$\psi(WR_iW^{-1}) = \psi(R_i) = 3$$
  
$$\psi(T_n) = \binom{n+1}{k}$$
  
using (1.1) we get that

$$\psi(T_n) = \sum_{i=1}^m \psi(W_i(R_{k_i})^{\epsilon_i} W_i^{-1})$$
$$\sum_{i=1}^m \epsilon_i \psi(R_{k_i}) \equiv m \pmod{2} \qquad (1.3)$$

# Finishing the proof of untileability

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems By putting (1.0),(1.1),(1.2),(1.3) together we obtain the following equation:

## Finishing the proof of untileability

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems By putting (1.0),(1.1),(1.2),(1.3) together we obtain the following equation:

$$\binom{n+1}{k} = w(\partial T_n; S) = \left[\frac{N+1}{3}\right]$$

This equation does not hold for  $n \equiv 3, 5, 6, 8 \pmod{12}$ , which proves:

## Finishing the proof of untileability

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems By putting (1.0),(1.1),(1.2),(1.3) together we obtain the following equation:

$$\binom{n+1}{k} = w(\partial T_n; S) = \left[\frac{N+1}{3}\right]$$

This equation does not hold for  $n \equiv 3, 5, 6, 8 \pmod{12}$ , which proves:

The triangular region  $T_n$  in the hexagonal lattice can be tiled by  $T_2$ 's only if  $n \equiv 0, 2, 9$ , or 11 (mod 12).

Untileability

### In the other cases, a tiling is possible

- A  $2 \times 3$  rectangle is tileable.
- A  $5 \times 6$  rectangle is tileable.
- Hence  $l \times 12k$  rectangles are tileable for l = 2, 9, 11 and, 12.

We can extend a tiling by observing a partition of  $T_{12k+l}$ :



Extending the tiling

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond

The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

# Introducing the lozenges

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems We now consider the third type of regular plane lattice, the triangular one. A *lozenge* (rhombus) is defined to be a region consisting of two adjacent cells. Below is depicted the set  $\mathcal{L}$  of the possible (non-equivalent by translation) placements of lozenges in the lattice.

# Introducing the lozenges

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems We now consider the third type of regular plane lattice, the triangular one. A *lozenge* (rhombus) is defined to be a region consisting of two adjacent cells. Below is depicted the set  $\mathcal{L}$  of the possible (non-equivalent by translation) placements of lozenges in the lattice.



Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

# The lattice as a Cayley graph

**Question**: For a region R in the lattice, bounded by a simple, closed, polygonal line  $\pi$ , what are the necessary and sufficient conditions that R admits a tiling by lozenges?

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Untileability

# The lattice as a Cayley graph

**Question**: For a region R in the lattice, bounded by a simple, closed, polygonal line  $\pi$ , what are the necessary and sufficient conditions that R admits a tiling by lozenges?

We establish a consistent labelling of the plane: one set of edges will be parallel to the horizontal axis, which set of edges will be named *a*. Analogously, the set of edges pointing at 120° will be labelled *b*, whereas the edges pointing at 240° will be labelled *c*. Let the free group generated by *a*,*b*, and *c*, be called F<sub>Δ</sub>, and the corresponding cycle group be C<sub>Δ</sub>.

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Untileability

# The lattice as a Cayley graph

**Question**: For a region R in the lattice, bounded by a simple, closed, polygonal line  $\pi$ , what are the necessary and sufficient conditions that R admits a tiling by lozenges?

- We establish a consistent labelling of the plane: one set of edges will be parallel to the horizontal axis, which set of edges will be named *a*. Analogously, the set of edges pointing at 120° will be labelled *b*, whereas the edges pointing at 240° will be labelled *c*. Let the free group generated by *a*,*b*, and *c*, be called F<sub>Δ</sub>, and the corresponding cycle group be C<sub>Δ</sub>.
- The cycle group of the triangular lattice is N((abc, cba)), the two words corresponding to anti-clockwise, and clockwise oriented boundaries of elementary triangles.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Untileability

# The tile group has a commutative quotient

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems For the three possible orientations of a lozenge, we obtain the following combinatorial boundaries:

# The tile group has a commutative quotient

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems For the three possible orientations of a lozenge, we obtain the following combinatorial boundaries:

 $\partial L_1 = b^{-1}a^{-1}ba$  $\partial L_2 = c^{-1}b^{-1}cb$  $\partial L_3 = a^{-1}c^{-1}ac$ 

Untileability

# The tile group has a commutative quotient

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems For the three possible orientations of a lozenge, we obtain the following combinatorial boundaries:

 $\partial L_1 = b^{-1}a^{-1}ba$  $\partial L_2 = c^{-1}b^{-1}cb$  $\partial L_3 = a^{-1}c^{-1}ac$ 

By analyzing the tile homotopy group  $h(\mathcal{L})$ , one can note that the above boundary words translate in commutativity relations: ab = ba, bc = cb, ca = ac, which shows that that  $h(\mathcal{L})$  is identified with a subgroup of  $\mathbb{Z}^3$  and in fact  $\mathbb{F}_{\Delta}/\mathcal{L}$  is isomorphic to  $\mathbb{Z}^3$ 

Untileability

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Consider the Cayley graph  $\mathbb{F}_{\Delta}/\mathcal{L} \equiv \mathbb{Z}^3$ . It can be naturally embedded into the Euclidean 3D space, as a cubical tesselation of the space, with the cubes are on their corners.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Consider the Cayley graph  $\mathbb{F}_{\Delta}/\mathcal{L} \equiv \mathbb{Z}^3$ . It can be naturally embedded into the Euclidean 3D space, as a cubical tesselation of the space, with the cubes are on their corners.



Lozenge tiling as the projection of a cubical tesselation

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Take a region in the plane that can be tiled by lozenges. It can be lifted, tile by tile, into the cubical skeleton. Each edge of a cube brings a change in height equal to  $\pm 1$ . The edge of the plane covered by a lozenge, lifts to a diagonal of a cubical face, which brings a height change of 2.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Take a region in the plane that can be tiled by lozenges. It can be lifted, tile by tile, into the cubical skeleton. Each edge of a cube brings a change in height equal to  $\pm 1$ . The edge of the plane covered by a lozenge, lifts to a diagonal of a cubical face, which brings a height change of 2.

Choose a starting point for the plane region to be tiled and trace the boundary.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Take a region in the plane that can be tiled by lozenges. It can be lifted, tile by tile, into the cubical skeleton. Each edge of a cube brings a change in height equal to  $\pm 1$ . The edge of the plane covered by a lozenge, lifts to a diagonal of a cubical face, which brings a height change of 2.

Choose a starting point for the plane region to be tiled and trace the boundary.

The invariant naturally associated to the boundary is the net rise in height obtained when lifting the edges one by one to the 3D space.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Take a region in the plane that can be tiled by lozenges. It can be lifted, tile by tile, into the cubical skeleton. Each edge of a cube brings a change in height equal to  $\pm 1$ . The edge of the plane covered by a lozenge, lifts to a diagonal of a cubical face, which brings a height change of 2.

Choose a starting point for the plane region to be tiled and trace the boundary.

The invariant naturally associated to the boundary is the net rise in height obtained when lifting the edges one by one to the 3D space.

The construction of the cubical tesselation indicates the necessity that this net rise in height is 0, in order to claim tileability.

Untileability

# Insufficiency of existence conditions

#### This is however not sufficient:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let cells with anti-clockwise oriented boundary *abc* be coloured blue, whereas *cba* cells will be coloured white.

# Insufficiency of existence conditions

#### This is however not sufficient:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let cells with anti-clockwise oriented boundary *abc* be coloured blue, whereas *cba* cells will be coloured white.
 Each lozenge covers a cell of each colour, so a clear condition for tileability, is that there is an equal number of white and blue triangles in a region.

# Insufficiency of existence conditions

#### This is however not sufficient:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

- Let cells with anti-clockwise oriented boundary *abc* be coloured blue, whereas *cba* cells will be coloured white.
  Each lozenge covers a cell of each colour, so a clear condition for tileability, is that there is an equal number of white and blue triangles in a region.
- This is equivalent to saying that the boundary of R lifts to a closed path in  $\mathbb{F}_{\Delta}/\mathcal{L}$ .



Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let v, w be two vertices in R, possibly on the boundary. We define d(v, w) to be the shortest length of a positively directed path in R (again, possibly on the boundary) which joins v and w.

Untileability

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let v, w be two vertices in R, possibly on the boundary. We define d(v, w) to be the shortest length of a positively directed path in R (again, possibly on the boundary) which joins v and w.

#### **Properties:**

The distance function is not symmetric, and in a connected region, well-defined.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let v, w be two vertices in R, possibly on the boundary. We define d(v, w) to be the shortest length of a positively directed path in R (again, possibly on the boundary) which joins v and w.

#### **Properties:**

- The distance function is not symmetric, and in a connected region, well-defined.
- Any closed positively directed edge path has its length a multiple of 3.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let v, w be two vertices in R, possibly on the boundary. We define d(v, w) to be the shortest length of a positively directed path in R (again, possibly on the boundary) which joins v and w.

#### **Properties:**

- The distance function is not symmetric, and in a connected region, well-defined.
- Any closed positively directed edge path has its length a multiple of 3.
- The above shows that d(v, w) is consistent modulo 3 independent on the chosen path.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Let v, w be two vertices in R, possibly on the boundary. We define d(v, w) to be the shortest length of a positively directed path in R (again, possibly on the boundary) which joins v and w.

#### **Properties:**

- The distance function is not symmetric, and in a connected region, well-defined.
- Any closed positively directed edge path has its length a multiple of 3.
- The above shows that d(v, w) is consistent modulo 3 independent on the chosen path.
- The three vertices of a triangle take three different values modulo 3.

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

Tilings Seminar, WS 09/10

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Recalling the height function previously considered for the vertices in  $\partial[R]$ , for any v, w on the boundary, with  $h(w) \ge h(v)$  we have  $h(w) - h(v) \ge d(v, w)$ , as a necessary condition for a tiling to be possible.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Recalling the height function previously considered for the vertices in  $\partial[R]$ , for any v, w on the boundary, with  $h(w) \ge h(v)$  we have  $h(w) - h(v) \ge d(v, w)$ , as a necessary condition for a tiling to be possible.

The condition is in fact sufficient:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Recalling the height function previously considered for the vertices in  $\partial[R]$ , for any v, w on the boundary, with  $h(w) \ge h(v)$  we have  $h(w) - h(v) \ge d(v, w)$ , as a necessary condition for a tiling to be possible.

The condition is in fact sufficient:

Extend the height function for the interior vertices of R as follows:

$$h(x) = \min_{v \in \pi} \left\{ d(v, x) \right\} + h(v)$$

All the vertices of a triangle take distinct values modulo 3, hence there exists an edge where the height changes by two.

Untileability

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice

Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems Recalling the height function previously considered for the vertices in  $\partial[R]$ , for any v, w on the boundary, with  $h(w) \ge h(v)$  we have  $h(w) - h(v) \ge d(v, w)$ , as a necessary condition for a tiling to be possible.

The condition is in fact sufficient:

Extend the height function for the interior vertices of R as follows:

$$h(x) = \min_{v \in \pi} \{d(v, x)\} + h(v)$$

All the vertices of a triangle take distinct values modulo 3, hence there exists an edge where the height changes by two.Construct a tiling by placing a lozenge over each such edge of a triangle.

Untileability
### **Motivation**

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems We have seen in the beginning that the generalised colouring arguments could be interpreted as maps from the cells of the lattice to an abelian group, (for finitely generated  $\mathcal{H}(\mathcal{T})$  there is a suitable choice of N, such that  $\mathbb{Z}_N$  can be the chosen abelian group).

### **Motivation**

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square

lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems We have seen in the beginning that the generalised colouring arguments could be interpreted as maps from the cells of the lattice to an abelian group, (for finitely generated  $\mathcal{H}(\mathcal{T})$  there is a suitable choice of N, such that  $\mathbb{Z}_N$  can be the chosen abelian group).

We will try to join these two approaches, by showing that extended colouring arguments can be all encoded in a quotient of the cycle group, thus shifting the focus from cell groups, to boundary word groups.

TU Berlin

### **Motivation**

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square

lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems We have seen in the beginning that the generalised colouring arguments could be interpreted as maps from the cells of the lattice to an abelian group, (for finitely generated  $\mathcal{H}(\mathcal{T})$  there is a suitable choice of N, such that  $\mathbb{Z}_N$  can be the chosen abelian group).

We will try to join these two approaches, by showing that extended colouring arguments can be all encoded in a quotient of the cycle group, thus shifting the focus from cell groups, to boundary word groups.

The following theorem will explain several group theoretical notions regarding the cycle group C.

TU Berlin

# Explicite definition of C and important subgroups

#### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias)

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems ○ The cycle group C consisting of all words W such that P(W) is a closed, directed path in Z<sup>2</sup>, is C = [𝔅 : 𝔅].

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

# Explicite definition of C and important subgroups

#### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias)

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The cycle group C consisting of all words W such that P(W) is a closed, directed path in Z<sup>2</sup>, is C = [F : F].
The group [C : C] consists of all words W such that P(W) is a closed directed path in Z<sup>2</sup> with winding number 0 around every cell in Z<sup>2</sup>. It follows that [C : C] is a normal subgroup of F.

Untileability

# Explicite definition of C and important subgroups

#### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias)

a normal subgroup of F.

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The cycle group C consisting of all words W such that P(W) is a closed, directed path in Z<sup>2</sup>, is C = [F : F].
The group [C : C] consists of all words W such that P(W) is a closed directed path in Z<sup>2</sup> with winding number 0 around every cell in Z<sup>2</sup>. It follows that [C : C] is

• The group  $A_0 = C/[C : C]$  is a direct sum of a countable number of copies of  $\mathbb{Z}$ , which are in one-to-one correspondence with the cells  $c_{ij}$  of the lattice  $\mathbb{Z}^2$ . The projection map  $\pi_{i,j} : C \to \mathbb{Z}$  onto the  $c_{ij}$ th summand of  $A_0$  is given by the winding number  $w(P(W); c_{ij})$ .

Untileability

TU Berlin

#### Sketch of proof:

## (1):

Colourings Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems "[F: F] ⊂ C": Note that a word defines a closed directed path iff U = U<sup>-1</sup> and A = A<sup>-1</sup>. As this happens for all commutators UVU<sup>-1</sup>V<sup>-1</sup> (where U and V are words in 𝔽), conclusion follows.

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

#### Sketch of proof:

## (1):

- Colourings Combinatorial group theory
- The square lattice The tile group
- Applications of CGT
- The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges
- Group theoretical remarks
- The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

[F: F] ⊂ C": Note that a word defines a closed directed path iff U = U<sup>-1</sup> and A = A<sup>-1</sup>. As this happens for all commutators UVU<sup>-1</sup>V<sup>-1</sup> (where U and V are words in 𝔽), conclusion follows.

■ " $C \subset [F:F]$ " : If  $c \in C$  has 2 or 4 edges, it is true. The proof is completed by induction, ordering the words in C lexicographically by (n, k, l), where n is the length of the word, k is the maximum value  $i^2 + j^2$  of any vertex, and l is the number of vertices with value k. The basic idea is to "cut out" a cell from the furthermost corner of the cycle, decomposing it in terms of lexicographically lower cycles.

#### Sketch of proof, continued:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems (2) Let  $C_1$  consist of all words W such that P(W) is a closed path with winding number 0 around all cells.  $C_1$  is clearly a normal subgroup of  $\mathbb{F}$ .

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

#### Sketch of proof, continued:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

# (2) Let $C_1$ consist of all words W such that P(W) is a closed path with winding number 0 around all cells. $C_1$ is clearly a normal subgroup of $\mathbb{F}$ .

[C : C] ⊆ C<sub>1</sub>": Follows from the additivity of the winding numbers:

$$w(W_1W_2W_1^{-1}W_2^{-1};c_{ij}) = w(W_1;c_{ij}) + w(W_2;c_{ij}) + w(W_1^{-1};c_{ij}) + w(W_2^{-1};c_{ij}) = 0;$$

Untileability

TU Berlin

#### Sketch of proof, continued:

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

# (2) Let $C_1$ consist of all words W such that P(W) is a closed path with winding number 0 around all cells. $C_1$ is clearly a normal subgroup of $\mathbb{F}$ .

 [C : C] ⊆ C<sub>1</sub>": Follows from the additivity of the winding numbers:

$$egin{aligned} &w(W_1W_2W_1^{-1}W_2^{-1};c_{ij})=w(W_1;c_{ij})+w(W_2;c_{ij})+\ &+w(W_1^{-1};c_{ij})+w(W_2^{-1};c_{ij})=0; \end{aligned}$$

• " $C_1 \subseteq [C : C]$ ": Follows by induction after the same lexicographical order as in (1).

Untileability

#### Colourings

#### Combinatorial group theory The square

(3)

lattice The tile group

#### Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

## Define the homomorphism $\pi = \bigotimes_{i,j} \pi_{i,j}$ from C to $\bigotimes_{(i,j)} \mathbb{Z}$ , by $\pi_{i,j} = w(P(W); c_{ij})$ . By part (1), this map is well defined, by (2), its kernel is [C : C].

Hence its image is isomorphic to C/[C : C].

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

Sketch of proof, continued:

TU Berlin

## Generalised colouring maps

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A generalised colouring map is a homomorphism  $\phi : C \rightarrow A$ , where A is an abelian group.

## Generalised colouring maps

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A generalised colouring map is a homomorphism  $\phi : C \rightarrow A$ , where A is an abelian group.

Every such φ, can be decomposed as the projection π : C → A<sub>0</sub> := C/[C : C], composed with a homomorphism π̃ : A<sub>0</sub> → A, hence the strongest generalised colouring map is in fact π itself.

## Generalised colouring maps

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems A generalised colouring map is a homomorphism  $\phi : C \rightarrow A$ , where A is an abelian group.

Every such φ, can be decomposed as the projection π : C → A<sub>0</sub> := C/[C : C], composed with a homomorphism π̃ : A<sub>0</sub> → A, hence the strongest generalised colouring map is in fact π itself.

■ In the particular case when  $A = \mathbb{Z}^k$ , the above can model standard colouring arguments. In that case  $\phi = \bigotimes_i \phi_i$ , where  $\phi_i(W)$ , counts the sum of the winding numbers of P(W) around cells coloured with the colour *i*.

TU Berlin

## Projecting the GCM to $h(\mathcal{T})$

#### A generalised colouring map checks whether

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

, i.e. whether

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

$$ilde{\phi}:h(\mathcal{T})(=C/\mathcal{T}(\mathcal{T})) o ilde{A}:=A/\phi(\mathcal{T}(\mathcal{T}))$$

 $\phi([\partial R]) \in \phi(T(\mathcal{T}))$ 

maps  $[\partial R]$  to the identity element in  $\tilde{A}$ .

## Projecting the GCM to $h(\mathcal{T})$

#### A generalised colouring map checks whether

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

. i.e. whether

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

$$ilde{\phi}:h(\mathcal{T})(=C/\mathcal{T}(\mathcal{T})) o ilde{A}:=A/\phi(\mathcal{T}(\mathcal{T}))$$

 $\phi([\partial R]) \in \phi(T(\mathcal{T}))$ 

maps  $[\partial R]$  to the identity element in  $\tilde{A}$ .

No information is lost by performing this projection, therefore generalised colouring arguments can be considered as being specified by homomorphisms  $\tilde{\phi}$  from the tile homotopy group  $h(\mathcal{T})$  to abelian groups  $\tilde{A}$ .

## (Re)introducing $B(\mathcal{T})$ and $H(\mathcal{T})$

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The maximal information available about tilings in this context is given by the projection  $\pi_s : h(\mathcal{T}) \to H(\mathcal{T})$ , where  $H(\mathcal{T})$  is the *tile homology group* introduced in the beginning, and in fact, the largest abelian quotient subgroup of  $h(\mathcal{T})$ .

## (Re)introducing $B(\mathcal{T})$ and $H(\mathcal{T})$

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The maximal information available about tilings in this context is given by the projection  $\pi_s : h(\mathcal{T}) \to H(\mathcal{T})$ , where  $H(\mathcal{T})$  is the *tile homology group* introduced in the beginning, and in fact, the largest abelian quotient subgroup of  $h(\mathcal{T})$ .

Looking at the natural projection  $\tilde{pi}: C \to C/T(T)$ , and taking the kernel of the map  $\pi_s \circ \tilde{pi}$  to be B(T), we obtain H(T) = C/B(T).

## (Re)introducing $B(\mathcal{T})$ and $H(\mathcal{T})$

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The maximal information available about tilings in this context is given by the projection  $\pi_s : h(\mathcal{T}) \to H(\mathcal{T})$ , where  $H(\mathcal{T})$  is the *tile homology group* introduced in the beginning, and in fact, the largest abelian quotient subgroup of  $h(\mathcal{T})$ .

Looking at the natural projection  $\tilde{pi}: C \to C/T(T)$ , and taking the kernel of the map  $\pi_s \circ \tilde{pi}$  to be B(T), we obtain H(T) = C/B(T).

 $B(\mathcal{T})$  is called the *tile boundary group* and it is the smallest normal subgroup of C containing  $T(\mathcal{T})$  and [C : C]. In fact the following holds:

$$B(\mathcal{T}) = T(\mathcal{T})[C:C]$$

Untileability

TU Berlin

## Restating the signed tiling theorem

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

#### The importance of this group $B(\mathcal{T})$ is given by the following:

## Restating the signed tiling theorem

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The importance of this group  $B(\mathcal{T})$  is given by the following:

#### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

A region R has a signed tiling by  $\mathcal{T}$  iff  $[\partial R] \in B(\mathcal{T})$ .

## Restating the signed tiling theorem

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The importance of this group  $B(\mathcal{T})$  is given by the following:

#### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

A region R has a signed tiling by  $\mathcal{T}$  iff  $[\partial R] \in B(\mathcal{T})$ .

Both directions are easy to show by direct expansion of the boundary word of the region in terms of the boundary of the tiles.



#### We can now derive the following:

#### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

Let R be a simply connected region and T a set of tiles. Consider the conditions:

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Untileability

#### We can now derive the following:

#### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

Let R be a simply connected region and T a set of tiles. Consider the conditions:

(H1): R can be tiled using tiles in T.

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

#### We can now derive the following:

#### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

Let R be a simply connected region and T a set of tiles. Consider the conditions:

(H1): R can be tiled using tiles in T.

(H2):  $[\partial R]$  is in the tile group T(T).

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Untileability

#### We can now derive the following:

#### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

Let R be a simply connected region and T a set of tiles. Consider the conditions:

(H1): R can be tiled using tiles in T.

(H2):  $[\partial R]$  is in the tile group  $T(\mathcal{T})$ .

(H3):  $[\partial R]$  is in the group B(T).

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

#### We can now derive the following:

#### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

Let R be a simply connected region and T a set of tiles. Consider the conditions:

(H1): R can be tiled using tiles in T.

(H2):  $[\partial R]$  is in the tile group  $T(\mathcal{T})$ .

(H3):  $[\partial R]$  is in the group B(T).

Then (H1)  $\Rightarrow$  (H2)  $\Rightarrow$  (H3). In general, the implications are not reversible.

Untileability

Colourings Combinatorial

group theory

The square lattice The tile group Applications

of CGT The Aztec diamond The hexagonal

lattice Lozenges Group theoretical

remarks The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

TU Berlin

### Proof of the above theorem

#### **Proof:**

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The statement  $(H1) \Rightarrow (H2)$  is exactly one of the theorems we have seen before.  $(H2) \Rightarrow (H3)$  is immediate, as  $T(T) \subset B(T)$ .

Untileability

## Proof of the above theorem

#### **Proof:**

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems The statement  $(H1) \Rightarrow (H2)$  is exactly one of the theorems we have seen before.  $(H2) \Rightarrow (H3)$  is immediate, as  $T(T) \subset B(T)$ .

To see that (H2) does not imply (H1), consider the following example, where the set of tiles consists of a  $3 \times 3$  square and a  $2 \times 2$  square.



Untileability

Thomas Hixon, Irina Mustata

TU Berlin

#### Colourings

## Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems

#### Proof, continued:

Finally, all the examples of regions which had signed tilings (Aztec square, the triangle tiled by tribones) did belong to B(T) (by the previous theorem), but the analysis of Cayley graphs showed that they don't belong to T(T), therefore (H3) does not imply (H2).

## A crowning result

#### Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems As a summing conclusion, a necessary and sufficient condition is expressed in the next

## A crowning result

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square

lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems As a summing conclusion, a necessary and sufficient condition is expressed in the next

#### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

Let R be a simply connected region and  $\mathcal{T}$  a set of tiles. Then R admits a tiling by  $\mathcal{T}$  iff  $[\partial R]$  is contained in the tile semigroup (monoid)  $\mathcal{T}^+(\mathcal{T})$ .



## A crowning result

Colourings

Combinatorial group theory The square

lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems As a summing conclusion, a necessary and sufficient condition is expressed in the next

#### Theorem (Conway, Lagarias):

Let R be a simply connected region and  $\mathcal{T}$  a set of tiles. Then R admits a tiling by  $\mathcal{T}$  iff  $[\partial R]$  is contained in the tile semigroup (monoid)  $\mathcal{T}^+(\mathcal{T})$ .

## The End

Untileability

TU Berlin

## Thank you for your attention!
## **References:**

## Colourings

Combinatorial group theory

The square lattice The tile group

Applications of CGT

The Aztec diamond The hexagonal lattice Lozenges

Group theoretical remarks

The tile boundary group Tiling theorems [1.] Conway, J.H. and Lagarias, J.C. Tiling with polyominoes and combinatorial group theory *Journal of Combinatorial Theory*, series A 53, 183-208, 1990.
[2.]Propp,James A Pedestrian Approach to a Method of Conway, or, a Tale of Two Cities *Mathematics Magazine* Vol. 70, No.5, pp.327-340, 1997.
[3.]Reid, Michael Tile homotopy groups *L'Einsegnement Mathematique* 49,no.1-2, pp.123-155, 2003.

[4.]Thurston, William P. Conway's tiling groups American Mathematical Monthly 95, 1990.

Untileability

TU Berlin